

Rule Change Proposal 2203

The following change was proposed by Bradford Shadowtalons owner Jon Thatcher on August 5, 2022. It failed to pass after receiving just one yeas vote from Governor Frank Perlmutter, and four nay votes from Governors Ted Sideriak, Chuck Seipel, Travis Davis, and Roger Johnson.

The proposal was as follows:

The Johnson Cup Fantasy Bowl should only comprise week 17 games, rather than a combination of weeks 17 & 18.

Comments from Jon Thatcher: The guiding principle is that all teams should be at full strength for elimination games. The essence of a fantasy football league, and particularly one that involves keepers, is to build a roster over the course of the season that can win in-season games to make the playoffs, and then be at peak strength to compete against the best assembled rosters. Week 18 games always involve random wild card factors that are not foreseeable at the beginning of the season: which NFL playoff teams won't be able to improve their playoff seeding by winning in week 18 and which teams will be tanking to secure a better draft spot, to name a couple. This proposal would eliminate the mad waivers scramble for the backups to the players on teams resting the starters that got you to the title game in the first place. If you have the lead after week 17 in the title game in the present format, it feels like the current system is saying "OK, your team beat the best other roster remaining... but before you are awarded the Johnson Cup, since you have 2 starters who will be rested this week, let's see how good you are at predicting which backup running back will emerge for essentially an exhibition Eagles/Cowboys game, where the teams are set to play each other in the first round of the playoffs regardless of the outcome." It feels like if we're going to try to predict performers in essentially exhibition games, we should extend the season forward to start during the preseason, when it's not single elimination and you still have the season to make up for it. This last sentence was hyperbole, and is not part of the proposal... I don't suggest we compete using preseason games.

Comments from Commissioner Jeff: Jon makes several valid points, however I oppose this proposal. The use of the two-week championship game dates back to the 1998 season, and it's one of the things which makes the ESFFL unique. It adds drama and strategy to the championship and forces fantasy owners to make tough decisions. While you cannot predict which teams will have something to play for at season's end in August, you can start to see that picture come together when the fantasy playoffs begin and thus makes the dynamics of waiver order and roster moves an important part of winning a championship. Even though you could argue fairness, both teams in the championship must play by the same rules, and I'd hate to see us lose those dynamics.

Comments from Governor Frank: I have always really disliked a week 18 playoff for the reasons Jon states in his commentary.

Comments from Governor Chuck: I enjoy the 2 week championship.

Comments from Governor Travis: Excited to be here. Although I was burnt with the two weeklong championship in the past. I feel like it's an interesting wrinkle to the league. I'd entertain other changes to week 17 and 18 if they are proposed, but for now I must vote "Nay".

Comments from Governor Ted: I like the week 18 wrinkle.

Comments from Governor Roger: I'm not a fan of having week 18 count either but knowing that others do, and it does give it some uniqueness, I'll vote nay (for now. It may come up again in future years). Besides, let's be honest, I haven't sniffed the championship since the trophy was named after my Bro and I 6,000 years ago so it really doesn't affect me.